

# Exhibit E

CERTIFIED COPY

1

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

-----x

VIOLA PLUMMER,

Plaintiff,

Civil Action No.

-against-

07 CV 6154(WHP)

CHRISTINE QUINN,

Speaker of the City Council,

Defendant.

-----x

August 14, 2007

1:24 p.m.

DEPOSITION of CHARLES MEARA, taken  
by the Plaintiff, pursuant to Notice, at the law  
offices of the Corporation Counsel, 100 Church  
Street, New York, New York before Karen Perlman,  
a Shorthand Reporter and Notary Public within and  
for the State of New York.

GREENHOUSE REPORTING, INC.

363 Seventh Avenue - 20th Floor

New York, New York 10001

(212) 279-5108

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

A P P E A R A N C E S :

LAW OFFICES OF ROGER S. WAREHAM, ESQ.

Attorneys for the Plaintiff

394 Putnam Avenue

Brooklyn, New York 11216

NEW YORK CITY LAW DEPARTMENT

OFFICE OF THE CORPORATION COUNSEL

Attorneys for Defendant

100 Church Street

New York, New York 10007

BY: PAUL MARKS, ESQ.

-and-

NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL

OFFICE OF THE GENERAL COUNSEL

Attorneys for Defendant

250 Broadway

New York, New York 10007

BY: ALVIN L. BRAGG, JR., ESQ.

ALSO PRESENT:

Viola Plummer

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

STIPULATIONS

IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED  
by and between the attorneys for the respective  
parties hereto, that all objections, except as to  
form, shall be reserved to the time of trial.

IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREED  
that the sealing and filing of the within  
deposition are hereby waived.

IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREED  
that the within deposition may be subscribed and  
sworn to by the witness being examined before a  
Notary Public other than the Notary Public before  
whom this deposition was begun.

1 C. Meara

2 C H A R L E S M E A R A, stating a business  
3 address of City Hall, New York, New  
4 York, having been first duly sworn  
5 by the Notary Public, was examined  
6 and testified under oath as follows:  
7

8 EXAMINATION

9 BY MR. WAREHAM:

10 Q. Good afternoon Mr. Meara?

11 A. Good afternoon. How are you?

12 Q. Fine, and you?

13 A. Good.

14 Q. My name is Roger Wareham, and I  
15 represent Ms. Plummer in this action. I just  
16 want to ask you a couple of preliminary  
17 questions. Have you ever been deposed before?

18 A. No.

19 Q. As you can tell you're already  
20 testifying under oath. If I ask you any  
21 questions that you don't understand either in  
22 terms of its form or its content, you should just  
23 ask me and I'll try to rephrase it and make it  
24 understandable.

25 You have to answer verbally, orally,

1 C. Meara

2 she can't record a shake of the head or that, so  
3 you have to say yes, I understand or something?

4 A. Yes, I understand.

5 Q. Have you taken any medications or  
6 anything that may impair your ability to answer  
7 clearly and understand what is going on today?

8 A. No.

9 Q. If you need to take a break or  
10 anything like that, just let us know, we'll do  
11 that.

12 A. Okay.

13 Q. What is your position on the  
14 Council?

15 A. I'm the Chief of Staff to the  
16 Speaker of the City Council.

17 Q. And how long have you been in that  
18 position?

19 A. About three years.

20 Q. And were you Chief of Staff for the  
21 previous Speaker as well?

22 A. For about a year and a half.

23 Q. And that was Gifford Miller?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. And what did you do prior to working

1 C. Meara

2 as Chief of Staff for the Speakers?

3 A. I worked at the Port Authority of  
4 New York and New Jersey.

5 Q. And what did you do there?

6 A. I did their intergovernmental work  
7 for New York.

8 Q. How long did you do that?

9 A. I was there 19 years.

10 Q. And what is the highest level of  
11 education that you attained?

12 A. I have a college degree.

13 Q. In what?

14 A. Political science and history.

15 Q. From where?

16 A. Maris College in Poughkeepsie.

17 Q. And what is the total amount of time  
18 that you've been working at the Council?

19 A. Three years and about two months.

20 Q. What are your responsibilities as  
21 Chief of Staff?

22 A. I have overall responsibility for  
23 the supervision of the staff, which includes  
24 legislative, it includes administrative services,  
25 member services, and I work with members.

1 C. Meara

2 Q. Does that also entail personnel  
3 responsibilities?

4 A. I have oversight of personnel  
5 responsibilities.

6 Q. And oversight means what? What is  
7 your definition of oversight?

8 A. Well, we have an administrative  
9 services division and they, through someone else,  
10 will ultimately report to me.

11 Q. So everything comes through you,  
12 before it gets to the Speaker, generally?

13 MR. MARKS: Objection, Objection to  
14 form.

15 You can answer.

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. Is there a flow chart, an  
18 administrative chart for the City Council that  
19 you're aware of?

20 A. Yeah, I've seen a flow chart.

21 Q. And everything sort of goes through  
22 you and then from you to the Speaker?

23 A. Ultimately, yes.

24 Q. Do you have any particular  
25 responsibilities at stated meetings of the



1 C. Meara

2 Council?

3 A. I usually stand near the Speaker and  
4 try to ensure that everything goes right.

5 Q. In your position as Chief of Staff,  
6 to the Speaker, do you also advise the Speaker on  
7 different issues that come up?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. On the procedure that is involved  
10 with co-naming of streets or renaming of  
11 streets --

12 MR. WAREHAM: Withdrawn.

13 Q. You're familiar with the procedure  
14 that is involved with co-naming of streets?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. And would it be fair to say that  
17 that involves the submission of names by Council  
18 people in a package that then gets at some point  
19 approved by the full Council or voted on by the  
20 full Council?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. When the package is first submitted,  
23 does it regularly go to the Parks and Recreations  
24 Committee?

25 A. Yes.

1 C. Meara

2 Q. And then the Parks and Recreations  
3 Committee sends it back to the full Council  
4 assuming it approves it?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Prior to the removal of the name  
7 of -- are you aware that the name of Sonny Carson  
8 was removed from the package by the Parks and  
9 Recreation Committee in I believe April of 2007?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Prior to that removal are you aware,  
12 had that ever happened before, where the Parks  
13 and Recreation Committee removed a name from a  
14 package that had been submitted?

15 A. Not that I'm aware of.

16 Q. To your knowledge, was the Speaker  
17 involved in discussions with members of the Parks  
18 and Recreations Committee about the removal of  
19 Sonny Carson's name from that package?

20 A. To my knowledge, no.

21 Q. Were you aware that prior to the  
22 meeting in the Parks and Recreation Committee,  
23 the Speaker had indicated that she had a problem  
24 with Sonny Carson's name being included in that  
25 package?

1 C. Meara

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. And that she had indicated that she  
4 was going to have that name removed from the  
5 package?

6 A. I think she indicated that she did  
7 not support including that name in the package.

8 Q. But your understanding -- you're  
9 saying she did not also further indicate that she  
10 was going to intervene to have the name removed  
11 from the package?

12 A. I -- I think she made her position  
13 on the name in the package clear.

14 Q. Prior to the meeting of the Parks  
15 and Recreations Committee, do you know if she  
16 spoke with any of the members of that committee  
17 concerning their vote on the Sonny Carson issue?

18 A. I don't -- I don't know that she  
19 did.

20 Q. Did you contact anyone, any members  
21 of the Parks and Recreation Committee prior to  
22 that concerning the Speaker's concerns?

23 A. I contacted members of the Parks and  
24 Recreation Committee to determine what their  
25 position was on the issue.

1 C. Meara

2 Q. So you were just taking a pole?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. Did you indicate to them that the  
5 Speaker did not support Sonny Carson's name being  
6 included in that package?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. Did you speak to Council Member Tish  
9 James, Leticia James about that?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. And did you indicate to her that  
12 there would be -- How many times prior to that  
13 meeting did you speak to her about that?

14 A. I believe once.

15 Q. And what about Council Member  
16 Gallagher?

17 A. Yes, I spoke to him.

18 Q. How many times did you speak to him?

19 A. I believe once.

20 Q. Did you speak to any of the members  
21 more than once?

22 A. I believe I spoke to the  
23 chairperson, Helen Foster more than once.

24 Q. And did she indicate whether she  
25 supported the Speaker's position?

1 C. Meara

2 A. Yes. She indicated.

3 Q. And what did she indicate?

4 A. That she did not support the  
5 Speaker's position.

6 Q. Is that the basis of you speaking to  
7 her more than once about it?

8 A. That was part of the basis, the  
9 other basis was that she, as the chair, I worked  
10 with her to make sure she understood, you know,  
11 how it would work as, you know, committee, that  
12 there would be a motion that would be introduced  
13 and et cetera.

14 Q. Did you indicate to her that there  
15 might be a penalty if she opposed the view of the  
16 Speaker on this issue?

17 A. Never.

18 Q. Did you indicate to Council Member  
19 James that there might be a perquisite if she  
20 supported the position of the Speaker?

21 A. No.

22 Q. Did you remind Council Member James  
23 that the Speaker has great influence over the use  
24 of discretionary funds?

25 A. No.

1 C. Meara

2 Q. At stated meetings generally, who's  
3 responsible for maintaining order at stated  
4 meetings, if you know?

5 A. I would say the Public Advocate.

6 Q. And that is as per the City Council  
7 rules?

8 A. Yes, working with the Speaker's  
9 office.

10 Q. And you stated that at the stated  
11 meetings you were usually near the Speaker?

12 A. Umm-hmm.

13 Q. And are there times when the Speaker  
14 will ask you to give instructions to the Public  
15 Advocate in terms of maintaining security at the  
16 meeting?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. Prior to the stated meeting of May  
19 30, 2007, was there a meeting of members of the  
20 Council in preparation for that stated meeting?

21 MR. MARKS: Objection to form.

22 You can answer.

23 A. Members of the Council?

24 Q. Was there a meeting with the Public  
25 Advocate and the Speaker around any concerns of

1 C. Meara

2 that upcoming stated meeting on May 30th?

3 A. There was a meeting with the Public  
4 Advocate, I can't tell you whether the Speaker  
5 was part of that meeting.

6 Q. And do you remember what day that  
7 was, was that the same day?

8 A. Probably the same day.

9 Q. Do you remember who else was  
10 present?

11 A. Probably just staff of the Speaker's  
12 office.

13 Q. And that would be who? Do you  
14 remember specifically who was there?

15 A. No, I don't even know that I was  
16 there, to be honest with you.

17 Q. You've been at so many that you  
18 can't sort of --

19 A. Yes, and from time to time we meet  
20 with the Public Advocate prior to a stated  
21 session, so it wasn't an unusual thing.

22 Q. So you're saying that that meeting  
23 was not necessarily out of the norm in terms of  
24 meetings that are held prior to stated meetings?

25 A. Well, we don't do it at every stated

1 C. Meara

2 meeting, but, you know, it wasn't -- it wasn't --  
3 we do it from time to time.

4 Q. To your knowledge, did the Speaker  
5 have any particular concerns before the stated  
6 meeting of May 30th around security?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. And what were those? What were  
9 those concerns?

10 A. We -- we knew that the matter that  
11 was going to be before the Council was  
12 controversial and there were a lot of emotions  
13 around the issue, and so I think that they would  
14 basically be the concerns of the Speaker.

15 Q. And you said you just don't remember  
16 whether or not you were at that meeting?

17 A. With the Public Advocate?

18 Q. Yes.

19 A. I don't. Ordinarily I wouldn't be,  
20 but I just don't know.

21 Q. And if I told you that -- are you  
22 familiar with Wayne Kawadler?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. Who is he?

25 A. He is a senior advisor to the



1 C. Meara

2 Speaker.

3 Q. And if I told you that he had  
4 testified that he remembered you being at that  
5 meeting on May 30, 2007, would that --

6 A. With the Public Advocate?

7 Q. With the Public Advocate.

8 A. I didn't say that I wasn't at the  
9 meeting, I just don't remember if I was.

10 Q. Do you remember who called the  
11 meeting?

12 A. No, I don't.

13 Q. Were any extraordinary security  
14 measures taken for that meeting --

15 MR. MARKS: Objection to form.

16 Q. -- that you're aware of?

17 MR. MARKS: You can answer.

18 A. Well, I -- I know that we worked  
19 with the NYPD, which has overall supervision of  
20 the building, so I don't know what they did in  
21 terms of extraordinary, you know, matters, but I  
22 think that there was -- I mean there was a lot of  
23 people there and, you know, more than usual  
24 so....

25 Q. Does the NYPD usually have in the

1 C. Meara

2 meetings that you've attended over the years,  
3 does the NYPD usually have a visible presence in  
4 the chambers in the gallery and the balcony?

5 A. Usually no, sometimes yes.

6 Q. And on that day did it have a  
7 visible presence?

8 A. I believe they did.

9 Q. Do you happen to remember how many  
10 uniforms?

11 A. No, I wouldn't know that.

12 Q. When the Public Advocate is  
13 presiding over the meeting, does the Speaker also  
14 have authority to clear the room?

15 A. I -- I don't know.

16 Q. But the Public Advocate clearly  
17 does, as far as you know?

18 A. I think the Public Advocate would  
19 act on behalf of the speaker if the Speaker  
20 wanted the room cleared.

21 Q. And on May 30th, to your  
22 recollection, was the room cleared that day?

23 A. It was not cleared.

24 Q. Were you there for the entire stated  
25 meeting on May 30, 2007?

1 C. Meara

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Did you observe Mrs. Plummer at the  
4 meeting that day?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Do you remember where she was...  
7 seated?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Where was that?

10 A. If -- if you're standing facing the  
11 front of the chamber, she was on the left hand  
12 side where there is a row of like two seats --  
13 two seats two by two, I don't know if she was in  
14 the first or second row, but she was near the  
15 front near where Councilman Barron sits.

16 Q. You're aware that Mrs. Plummer -- of  
17 course you're aware.

18 And do you remember sending a letter  
19 to Ms. Plummer dated June 28, 2007 where you're  
20 referring to disruptive actions at the Council  
21 stated meeting of May 30, 2007?

22 A. Yes, I do.

23 Q. And did you witness this disruptive  
24 conduct?

25 A. Yes, I did.

1 C. Meara

2 Q. Can you please describe what the  
3 disruptive conduct consisted of?

4 A. During the course of the meeting, as  
5 the matter of the Sonny Carson street renaming  
6 was being discussed, she disrupted the meeting by  
7 yelling a number of times, both during remarks of  
8 members and during the votes by particular  
9 members.

10 Q. And when you say a number of times,  
11 how many? One? Two? Three? Four? 10? 15?  
12 19?

13 A. I would say 10 or 15, roughly.

14 Q. What was she yelling? What did she  
15 say?

16 A. I heard her yell specifically  
17 "Liar", I heard her yell specifically, "Shut up".

18 Q. Anything else?

19 A. That is what I recall.

20 Q. What steps if any did --

21 MR. WAREHAM: Withdrawn.

22 Q. Was anyone else in the room engaged  
23 in quote/unquote disruptive conduct?

24 A. There were some people in the  
25 balcony who were disruptive, but no one else on

1 C. Meara

2 the -- what I call the floor of the Council.

3 Q. What steps, if any, did the  
4 presiding officer take in the face of Ms.  
5 Plummer's disruptive conduct?

6 MR. MARKS: Objection to form, but  
7 you can answer.

8 A. A number of times she tried to use  
9 the gavel to quiet the disruption, and she did  
10 that repeatedly, actually.

11 Q. Did she say anything when she was  
12 using the gavel?

13 A. She kept asking for quiet.

14 Q. Did she specifically address  
15 Mrs. Plummer in terms of a request for quiet?

16 A. I think she at least once directed  
17 her -- her remarks to the area that Mrs. Plummer  
18 was in.

19 Q. She specified whoever was making  
20 noise to my right, please be quiet?

21 A. I don't know if she was that  
22 specific.

23 Q. When you say --

24 A. It was clear, it was only disruption  
25 coming from one place on the floor of the

1 C. Meara

2 Council, and at least once she was directing  
3 herself to them.

4 Q. When you say directing herself, what  
5 did she do in the case that she was directing  
6 herself to that area?

7 A. There was only one person at the  
8 time yelling, and she directed her comments to  
9 the person yelling to be quiet.

10 Q. Do you remember specifically what  
11 she said?

12 A. No, I don't remember specifically  
13 what she said.

14 Q. Did she order the Sergeant of Arms  
15 to remove Ms. Plummer or whoever that person was  
16 causing the disruption?

17 A. No.

18 Q. What did Speaker Quinn do while this  
19 disruptive conduct was occurring?

20 MR. MARKS: Objection to form but  
21 you can answer.

22 A. She asked me at one point to have  
23 the Public Advocate, you know, quiet down the  
24 crowd.

25 Q. Quiet down the crowd or quiet down

1 C. Meara

2 Mrs. Plummer?

3 A. I don't know that her comments were  
4 directed specifically to Mrs. Plummer, but they  
5 were -- she was the only one on the floor making  
6 comments.

7 Q. But she asked that you quiet down  
8 the crowd?

9 A. Making noise on the floor, yeah.

10 Q. And when she said that to you, what  
11 did you do?

12 A. At one point, and I don't know if it  
13 was directly at this time, I asked the director  
14 of security to see what was going on.

15 Q. And who is that?

16 A. Carl D'Alba.

17 Q. What did he do?

18 A. I know he went over there, I don't  
19 know what he did.

20 Q. He went over where?

21 A. To the area where Ms. Plummer was.

22 Q. You saw him do that?

23 A. I saw him go over, yes, I don't know  
24 specifically what he said.

25 Q. Did you see him talking to

1 C. Meara

2 Mrs. Plummer?

3 A. I saw him in the general area, I  
4 didn't see him speak specifically to  
5 Mrs. Plummer, but I asked him to go over there  
6 and, you know, he went over there.

7 Q. Who else was in that general area at  
8 that time?

9 A. Well, there are a number of  
10 Councilmen who sit right there, and I don't know  
11 who else was sitting with Ms. Plummer.

12 Q. Was she sitting by herself?

13 A. I don't recall.

14 Q. Did Ms. Plummer's quote/unquote  
15 disruptive actions prevent the vote, the vote on  
16 Councilman Vann's amendment to include Sonny  
17 Carson's name in the co-naming package?

18 A. No, it went forward.

19 Q. Did it disrupt the subsequent vote  
20 on the entire co-naming package?

21 A. No, that went forward.

22 Q. Did the Council complete the  
23 scheduled agenda for that day?

24 A. Yes, it did.

25 Q. To your recollection, was anyone



1 C. Meara

2 removed from the Council that day for disruptive  
3 behavior?

4 A. No.

5 Q. And the disruptive behavior you're  
6 attributing to Ms. Plummer were words that she  
7 shouted out?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. During your tenure as Chief of  
10 Staff, have there been any other meetings of the  
11 stated meetings of the Council where there has  
12 been disruptive conduct?

13 A. No.

14 Q. So this is the first meeting where  
15 there was disruptive -- -

16 A. The first stated meeting.

17 Q. Were you at the stated meeting, the  
18 meeting prior to May 30, 2007?

19 A. I'm sure.

20 Q. Was there any disruption in the  
21 discussion around the, I think, the Taxi and  
22 Limousine Commission?

23 A. I -- I don't know if that was the  
24 meeting prior to, but when that meeting occurred,  
25 if you're talking about the petty cab issue?

1 C. Meara

2 Q. Yes.

3 A. Yes, there was disruption in the  
4 gallery that day.

5 Q. So when you say there hasn't been  
6 any disruption in the stated meeting, you're  
7 distinguishing between the balcony --

8 A. Yes, sir.

9 Q. -- and the gallery.

10 MR. MARKS: No, no. You said the  
11 balcony and the gallery.

12 A. The balcony and the floor, I call it  
13 the floor of the stated -- of the Council.

14 Q. Right.

15 A. Right.

16 Q. The Public Advocate calls it the  
17 gallery.

18 MR. WAREHAM: Remember?

19 MR. MARKS: I think just for -- so  
20 the record is clear.

21 MR. WAREHAM: The floor.

22 MR. MARKS: I want to make it clear.

23 The floor, okay.

24 Q. Have there been disruptions at  
25 committee meetings that you're aware of?

1 C. Meara

2 A. There have been disruptions at  
3 committee meetings that have been brought to my  
4 attention, I was not personally at them.

5 Q. Have those disruptions involved  
6 staff members of individual Council members that  
7 you're aware?

8 A. That was brought to my attention,  
9 yes.

10 Q. And do you remember, can you tell me  
11 what that was, what the disruption was and whose  
12 staff member was involved?

13 A. It was brought to my attention by a  
14 number of members that Councilman Barron's staff  
15 person Ms. Plummer was disruptive at a number of  
16 committee meetings.

17 Q. Can you specify when? Date?

18 A. No.

19 Q. Time? How many?

20 A. One was brought to my attention was  
21 the civil rights committee meeting, and one that  
22 was brought to my attention was the public safety  
23 committee.

24 Q. Those were separate meetings?

25 A. I don't know if that was separate or

1 C. Meara

2 the same meeting.

3 Q. And what were you told was the  
4 nature of the disruption by Mrs. Plummer?

5 A. That during the course of the  
6 meeting she, at various times, yelled out certain  
7 things, I don't know specifically what.

8 Q. And who was chairing that meeting?

9 A. I believe Councilman Seabrook was  
10 chairing, and Councilman Vallone was chairing.

11 Q. And what, if any, steps did they  
12 take to address the disruption caused by Ms.  
13 Plummer?

14 A. I believe that as chairs they tried  
15 to use their gavel to bring quiet to the meeting.

16 Q. And you say "Tried", does that mean  
17 that they did not succeed?

18 A. I wasn't there, I don't know that it  
19 succeeded.

20 Q. At committee meetings, is there a  
21 Sergeant At Arms present?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Do you know whether they had the  
24 Sergeant of Arms escort Ms. Plummer out of the  
25 meeting?

1 C. Meara

2 A. I don't believe they did.

3 Q. That was the prerogative the chair  
4 in face of a disruption if they thought it was  
5 interfering with the work of their committee?

6 A. Correct.

7 Q. Aside from this meeting of the civil  
8 rights and public safety commission was there any  
9 other committee meetings that to your knowledge  
10 Ms. Plummer was accused of disruptive conduct?

11 A. Not to my knowledge.

12 Q. And did it come to your attention at  
13 some point that Mrs. Plummer had made a remark  
14 concerning the assassination of Councilman  
15 Comrie's ass?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. And when did that come to your  
18 attention?

19 A. Some time after the stated meeting  
20 was completed.

21 Q. And where were you when it came to  
22 your attention?

23 A. I was in the Speaker's office.

24 Q. And who brought it to your  
25 attention?

1 C. Meara

2 A. I can't remember.

3 Q. And what were you told was the  
4 remark, as you understood it to be?

5 A. I was told that at a press  
6 conference, the -- that Ms. Plummer said that she  
7 -- she voiced that she wanted the assassination  
8 of Councilman Comrie's ass.

9 Q. Sorry. What did you interpret that  
10 remark to mean?

11 MR. MARKS: Objection to form, but  
12 you can answer.

13 A. Well, we took it very seriously.

14 Q. And by taking it very seriously,  
15 what did that mean?

16 A. Well, I asked the -- well, what it  
17 means we were very concerned about it. We -- I  
18 asked for the -- to see if we can get a copy of  
19 what she said. I called Councilman Comrie  
20 immediately and asked him to come to the office,  
21 and I called Lieutenant Brennan, who is the head  
22 of the City Hall security for the NYPD.

23 Q. And what happened after that?

24 A. Councilman Comrie came to the office  
25 and Lieutenant Brennan came to the office, and we

1 C. Meara

2 discussed the matter.

3 And Councilman Comrie said at that  
4 time that he took the matter very seriously.

5 I asked Lieutenant Brennan for his  
6 opinion, he took it seriously. I asked  
7 Lieutenant Brennan to have some security for  
8 Councilman Comrie, since he was having an event  
9 that night, and he agreed to do that.

10 Q. Did Councilman Comrie indicate that  
11 he felt physically threatened by Viola Plummer?

12 A. We said to him, "Do you take this  
13 seriously?" He said, "I take it very seriously".

14 Q. And that was the nature of the  
15 question to him in terms of whether --

16 A. Right.

17 Q. -- he really thought Viola Plummer  
18 was going to assassinate him?

19 MR. MARKS: Objection to form.

20 You can answer.

21 A. I think that the concern was broader  
22 than Viola Plummer. I think that the concern was  
23 that it was a very emotional day, there were very  
24 high passions, and no one really knew who Viola  
25 was saying it to. So it wasn't simply a question

1 C. Meara

2 of whether Viola was going to do something, it  
3 was a question of who might hear the word  
4 assassinate attached to Councilman Comrie, and I  
5 think -- so the concern was broader than just  
6 Viola Plummer.

7 Q. So the concern was that it might be  
8 a hidden directive?

9 MR. MARKS: Objection to form.

10 A. Yes. Or someone might take it as a  
11 hidden directive.

12 Q. Did you approach Ms. Plummer or  
13 Councilman Barron to ask her about her remark?

14 A. No.

15 Q. Did anyone consider approaching Ms.  
16 Plummer or Councilman Barron to ask them  
17 personally about the remark she made and what she  
18 meant by it.

19 A. I don't know what others may have  
20 considered.

21 Q. Did the Speaker consider doing that?

22 A. I don't know what the Speaker  
23 considered doing.

24 Q. Did you advise the Speaker that, you  
25 know, maybe we should talk to Councilman Barron



1 C. Meara

2 and Ms. Plummer about these remarks?

3 A. No, I did not advise the Speaker to  
4 do that.

5 Q. Do you know if anyone did?

6 A. I don't know.

7 Q. Why not?

8 MR. MARKS: You mean why didn't he?

9 Q. Why didn't you approach Councilman  
10 Barron or the Speaker, Councilman Barron or Ms.  
11 Plummer about the remark?

12 A. Well, I wouldn't have approached  
13 Councilman Barron, since they weren't his  
14 remarks, if I --

15 Q. Why didn't you approach Ms. Plummer?

16 A. Because she explained the remarks  
17 later in the -- in the press conference and I  
18 just thought that the use of the word  
19 "Assassinate" in City Hall given what -- given  
20 the history there was so inflammatory that there  
21 was -- there was no explanation.

22 And again, it wasn't only what Viola  
23 may have meant by the remarks, it was what  
24 someone may have taken from those remarks, and  
25 she was never in a position to explain that to me

1 C. Meara

2 in a satisfactory way.

3 Q. But you said she explained it later  
4 in the press conference?

5 A. She said --

6 Q. What was her explanation?

7 A. She talked about it being a  
8 political assassination.

9 Q. Did you have the same response when  
10 Councilman Vallone talked about stringing up Con  
11 Ed from a light post?

12 A. I don't know that he said that.

13 Q. You're not familiar at the point  
14 where they had the blackout in Queens, Councilman  
15 Vallone said that Con Ed should be strung from a  
16 lamp post?

17 A. I know that they had a blackout in  
18 Queens, I don't know that Council Vallone said  
19 that, I'm not saying he didn't say that, I'm just  
20 saying I don't know that he said that.

21 Q. So you're saying there was no  
22 explanation that would have been acceptable to  
23 you once the word "Assassinate" was issued on the  
24 property of City Hall?

25 A. Correct.

1 C. Meara

2 Q. So that is a taboo word in City  
3 Hall, character assassination cannot --  
4 assassination cannot be used in any context  
5 without there being a security response?

6 MR. MARKS: Objection to form.

7 You can answer.

8 A. Character assassination is one  
9 thing, that is not what she said.

10 Q. But you focused on the word  
11 "Assassination"?

12 A. Correct.

13 Q. And she explained political  
14 assassination, and in the same press conference,  
15 quote/unquote press conference, I'm not conceding  
16 it was a press conference --

17 A. Right.

18 Q. -- explained that she meant it was a  
19 political assassination of his political career,  
20 but your position was that genie is out of the  
21 box and therefore it required a security  
22 response?

23 A. I think it --

24 MR. MARKS: Objection to form.

25 You can answer.

1 C. Meara

2 A. -- it required a serious response  
3 which included security.

4 Q. So basically the word she uttered  
5 required that response?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. And how long was security supplied  
8 to Council Member Comrie, if you're aware?

9 A. I believe it was supplied for that  
10 evening.

11 Q. Did Council Member Comrie file a  
12 complaint with the police department?

13 A. I'm not aware that he did.

14 Q. Was he advised to, if you know?

15 A. There was a discussion as to whether  
16 he should, I don't know whether he was advised to  
17 or not.

18 Q. What was your view, do you think  
19 that he should have filed a complaint with the  
20 police department?

21 MR. MARKS: Objection to form.

22 THE WITNESS: I can answer?

23 MR. MARKS: You can answer.

24 A. I -- I didn't really have an opinion  
25 one way or the other.

1 C. Meara

2 Q. Do you know what the Speaker's  
3 position was --

4 A. No.

5 Q. -- around filing the complaint?

6 A. I don't know.

7 Q. At the point in time, aside from the  
8 security measures that were taken that evening --

9 MR. WAREHAM: Withdrawn.

10 Q. What steps did the Speaker take on  
11 that evening in terms of Mrs. Plummer's  
12 assassination comment, if any?

13 A. Well, one was the security, which  
14 we've already talked about, and the second was we  
15 asked the office -- I believe it was that night,  
16 we asked the Office of the General Counsel to see  
17 what options would be available to us.

18 Q. Options in terms of?

19 A. A discipline.

20 Q. Did that include firing at that  
21 point, or just discipline?

22 A. We -- I don't think we specified  
23 specifically, we just wanted to know what the  
24 options were.

25 Q. And was the Speaker concerned that

1 C. Meara

2 she did not have authority to discipline Ms.  
3 Plummer because she was the employee of an  
4 individual Council Member?

5 A. She didn't --

6 MR. MARKS: Objection to form..

7 You can answer.

8 A. She didn't know if she had the  
9 authority, and that is what she asked the General  
10 Counsel's office to research.

11 Q. Did she think she had the authority?  
12 Prior to getting an opinion from the General  
13 Counsel, did she think she had the authority to  
14 discipline Ms. Plummer?

15 MR. MARKS: Objection.

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. Did she think she had the authority  
18 to fire Ms. Plummer?

19 A. We didn't know.

20 Q. What was her view, I'm talking about  
21 immediately after, what was her view of the  
22 source of her authority to discipline  
23 Mrs. Plummer?

24 MR. MARKS: Objection to form.

25 You can answer.

1 C. Meara

2 A. Well, we had on other occasions  
3 dealt with staff of members in a number of ways  
4 which indicated to us that we had the authority  
5 to discipline a member of the staff of a member.

6 Q. Had the Speaker actually disciplined  
7 a staff member of an individual Council Member  
8 prior to this action taken against Mrs. Plummer?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. And when was that and who was that?

11 A. The -- I don't remember the exact  
12 dates, but one was a member of Councilman  
13 McMahon's staff and one was a member of  
14 Councilman Rivera's staff.

15 We had also as a matter of policy  
16 enacted a requirement that members and their  
17 staff do training for various -- in various  
18 areas, and had disciplined staff if they didn't  
19 do the training.

20 Q. The time with Council Member Vann's  
21 staff --

22 A. Not Vann, McMahon.

23 Q. McMahon?

24 A. Not Vann.

25 Q. I'm sorry, McMahon?

1 C. Meara

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. What was the nature of the incident  
4 and what was the nature of the discipline that was  
5 enacted?

6 A. There was a -- a complaint filed  
7 with the Department of Investigations about the  
8 Councilman and his staff use of staff in his  
9 district office. And D -- DOI's investigation  
10 showed that they had inappropriately used on one  
11 occasion staff in the district office, and they  
12 did not discipline Councilman McMahon, but we  
13 disciplined the member of the staff and required  
14 that he participate in certain training.

15 Q. Did Councilman McMahon have to sign  
16 off on that discipline?

17 A. No, I believe we told him.

18 Q. And he agreed to it?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. And if he had not agreed to it,  
21 would you have been able to enact that  
22 discipline?

23 A. I believe so.

24 Q. And the authority for that would  
25 have been?



1 C. Meara

2 A. The Speaker's office.

3 Q. And in this particular case, the  
4 discipline was seen as a remedy after the  
5 completion of an investigation by the Department  
6 of Investigation?

7 A. Right.

8 Q. And did that investigation entail  
9 interviews with the staff member involved?

10 A. I don't know.

11 Q. Was there any hearing involved in  
12 that investigation?

13 A. I don't believe so.

14 Q. Did it involve discussion with the  
15 Council Member McMahon himself?

16 A. Only as it pertained to his  
17 involvement.

18 Q. And that the discipline involved was  
19 taking a training course?

20 A. Right.

21 Q. It didn't involve suspension --

22 A. No.

23 Q. -- or termination?

24 A. Correct.

25 Q. And if the staff member had not

1 C. Meara

2 agreed to take the training course, what was the  
3 or else?

4 A. We never had to give an or else.

5 Q. But Councilman McMahon never  
6 challenged that?

7 MR. MARKS: McMahon.

8 Q. McMahon.

9 MR. WAREHAM: I said McMahon.

10 MR. MARKS: Sorry.

11 MR. WAREHAM: I got it this time.

12 THE WITNESS: He did.

13 Q. Did the staff member involved have  
14 to sign any agreement acknowledging that he or  
15 she had committed an impropriety and agreeing to  
16 the training?

17 A. I don't know, to be -- I don't know.  
18 Not that I know of, but I don't know for sure.

19 Q. And how long was the training course  
20 that this staff member had to take in terms of  
21 hours?

22 A. I don't know.

23 Q. And what was the incident involving  
24 Council -- which Rivera, Joel?

25 A. Joel Rivera.

1 C. Meara

2 Q. What the incident involving his  
3 staff member?

4 A. There was a -- I believe it was a  
5 DOI investigation of a staff member, and I don't  
6 remember the specifics to be honest with you, but  
7 we imposed a discipline on him to take a training  
8 as well, and Councilman Rivera at first resisted  
9 it but didn't think it was appropriate, but then  
10 we -- we insisted and as I understand it the  
11 staff member did the training.

12 Q. The same question, did that member  
13 have to sign anything?

14 A. Not that I'm -- I don't know for  
15 sure, but not that I know of.

16 Q. And was there an or else, if they  
17 didn't agree to it they would face termination,  
18 suspension or termination?

19 A. No, we never got to that point.

20 Q. So it in effect involved a voluntary  
21 compliance with the request?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. And if Council Member Rivera had  
24 continued to resist, what steps would you have  
25 taken to enforce that discipline?

1 C. Meara

2 A. I never got to that point.

3 Q. And once again the authority for  
4 that came from?

5 A. The Speaker's office.

6 Q. So those are the two instances that  
7 you're aware of where in the past the Speaker has  
8 imposed some form of discipline on an individual  
9 Council members staff?

10 MR. MARKS: Object to the form.

11 You can answer.

12 Q. Are those the only two instances  
13 that you're aware of?

14 A. I don't know that we ever imposed  
15 any discipline as a result of not completing the  
16 training sessions that I referred to earlier, but  
17 that would be the only other instance.

18 Q. Are you aware of any instances where  
19 the Speaker suspended the staff of an individual  
20 Council Member?

21 A. No.

22 Q. Are you aware of any instances where  
23 the Speaker terminated the employment of a staff  
24 of an individual Council Member?

25 A. No.

1 C. Meara

2 Q. Were you at the stated meetings of  
3 June 14th and 27th of 2007?

4 A. I'm sure.

5 Q. Do you remember whether Mrs. Plummer  
6 was there?

7 A. I don't.

8 Q. Were there any disruptions at that  
9 meeting?

10 A. No.

11 Q. Those meetings, that you're aware  
12 of?

13 A. No.

14 Q. Are you a familiar with the New York  
15 City Council policy against harassment and  
16 discrimination?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. Do you know whether the Speaker  
19 brought a complaint against Ms. Plummer pursuant  
20 to that policy?

21 A. I don't believe this was a matter  
22 regarding discrimination or harassment.

23 Q. So does that mean she did not?

24 A. It means she did not.

25 Q. Do you know whether Council Member

1 C. Meara

2 Comrie brought a complaint around harassment of  
3 Mrs. Plummer pursuant to that policy?

4 A. I -- I'm not aware of that.

5 Q. Are you aware that the Speaker.  
6 expressed concern in the early part of June,  
7 around taking action against Ms. Plummer as she  
8 worked for quote, an independent Council member?

9 MR. MARKS: Objection to form, but  
10 you can answer.

11 A. That was why we asked the General  
12 Counsel's office to research what the options  
13 were that would be available to us.

14 Q. Because Mrs. Plummer was working for  
15 Council Member Barron, not the central staff?

16 A. Correct.

17 Q. And at what point in time did the  
18 Speaker arrive at a firm conclusion that she had  
19 the authority to suspend and/or terminate  
20 Mrs. Plummer?

21 MR. MARKS: Objection to form, but  
22 you can answer.

23 A. I don't recall the exact date, but  
24 it was when the General Counsel's office had  
25 completed their research.

1 C. Meara

2 Q. And what is your understanding of  
3 the basis for the Speaker's authority to  
4 terminate the staff member of an individual  
5 Council Member?

6 A. Well, I'm not a lawyer, but my  
7 understanding is that as the head of Council, the  
8 Speaker of the Council, she's the head of the  
9 agency, and as head of the agency she has that  
10 authority.

11 Q. And are you familiar with the  
12 provisions of the Charter, the New York City  
13 Charter that concerned the City Council?

14 A. I've never read them.

15 Q. Let me show you what has been marked  
16 as Plaintiff's Exhibit 1, this is the one from  
17 the Gotbaum deposition.

18 THE WITNESS: This is the what,  
19 excuse me?

20 Q. This is the one we did with Gotbaum,  
21 and I want to draw your attention to section 21?

22 MR. MARKS: I just want to make it  
23 clear --

24 MR. WAREHAM: This is the full one.

25 MR. MARKS: Right, but I just want

1 C. Meara

2 to make it clear for the record and, you  
3 know, I don't want to be accused of making  
4 speaks objections, so actually before I say  
5 what I'm going to say, I'm wondering if it  
6 would be better --

7 MR. WAREHAM: -- if he stepped out  
8 of the room.

9 MR. MARKS: -- if he stepped out of  
10 the room.

11 MR. WAREHAM: Why don't we do that.

12 (Whereupon the witness leaves the  
13 conference room.)

14 MR. MARKS: Off the record.

15 (Discussion held off the record.)

16 (Whereupon the witness enters the  
17 conference room.)

18 Q. Let me just show you Plaintiff's  
19 Exhibit 1, which is excerpts from the New York  
20 City Charter, the chapters that specifically  
21 address the Council. And I just want to draw  
22 your attention to section 21, just read through  
23 that to yourself.

24 A. Okay.

25 Q. And --



1 C. Meara

2 A. You're not going to ask me to repeat  
3 it back, are you?

4 Q. No. If you could just read the first  
5 sentence of section 21?

6 A. "The Council, there shall be a  
7 Council which shall be the legislative body of  
8 the City."

9 Q. Now, you said that your  
10 understanding is that the Speaker derives her  
11 authority to discipline or terminate the  
12 employment of individual staff members of  
13 individual Council members through her position  
14 as head of the agency?

15 You have to speak.

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. And your understanding is that the  
18 City Council of New York is an agency of the City  
19 of New York?

20 A. Correct.

21 Q. And how did you arrive at that  
22 understanding?

23 A. Well, as I mentioned before, we  
24 asked the General Counsel's office to research  
25 what options were available to us and that was

1 C. Meara

2 what they said.

3 MR. MARKS: Object to the extent  
4 it's -- you shouldn't testify about any  
5 attorney-client privileged matter what the  
6 General Counsel's office of the Council  
7 said to you or anybody else.

8 THE WITNESS: Okay.

9 Q. And that authority allows her, gives  
10 her control over, nominally gives her control  
11 over the staff of every City Council member?

12 MR. MARKS: Objection to form.

13 You can answer.

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. And is it your understanding that  
16 when members of the City Council elect one of  
17 their fellow members as Speaker, that they are  
18 giving that person control over the suspension  
19 and firing of their individual staff?

20 A. I don't know what members thought  
21 when they elected the Speaker.

22 Q. Were you present during the election  
23 of Speaker Quinn as the Speaker?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Was there, to your recollection, was

1 C. Meara

2 there any discussion of the responsibilities of  
3 the Speaker during that election?

4 A. By election I mean that I was  
5 present when the Council members voted for the  
6 Speaker.

7 Q. Prior to the election, were there  
8 any discussions concerning what the task of the  
9 Speaker or the responsibilities of the Speaker  
10 are?

11 A. I wasn't involved in any of those.

12 Q. When a Council member wants to hire  
13 someone for their staff, does the Speaker have  
14 the approval of that hire?

15 A. I know that the paperwork goes  
16 through the administrative services division but  
17 we generally don't approve of hires for Council  
18 member.

19 Q. Does the Speaker disapprove of  
20 hires?

21 A. Not that I'm aware of.

22 Q. Does the Speaker sign off on any of  
23 the paperwork necessary for a person to be hired?

24 A. The Speaker personally?

25 Q. Yes.

1 C. Meara

2 A. Not that I'm aware of.

3 Q. Anyone from the Speaker's office?

4 A. I don't know what administrative  
5 services people sign.

6 Q. At some point in June did the  
7 Speaker instruct you to write a letter to Ms.  
8 Plummer informing her of her suspension?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. And did you write that letter?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Who had input in terms of the  
13 content of that letter?

14 A. The General Counsel's office, I  
15 don't know that anyone else did.

16 MR. WAREHAM: You had put that in as  
17 defendants, so I guess I have to put it in  
18 separately?

19 MR. MARKS: Off the record.

20 (Discussion held off the record.)

21 Q. Let me show you what was marked as  
22 Defendant's B which is --

23 A. Do you want this back?

24 Q. You can put it right there.

25 Does that look familiar to you?

1 C. Meara

2 What do you recognize that to be?

3 A. I recognize it to be a letter that I  
4 sent to Ms. Plummer.

5 Q. And you said input was made from the  
6 General Counsel's office and the Speaker in terms  
7 of the content of the letter?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. And that letter is dated?

10 A. June 28, 2007.

11 Q. And it was at that point in time  
12 that by June 28th --

13 MR. WAREHAM: Withdrawn.

14 MR. MARKS: Sorry to interrupt.

15 Off the record.

16 (Discussion held off the record.)

17 Q. And after the this legal action was  
18 brought, was there a subsequent letter that you  
19 sent to Ms. Plummer dated July 5th?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. And the content of that letter was  
22 composed by whom?

23 MR. MARKS: Objection to form.

24 You can answer.

25 A. The General Counsel's office.

1 C. Meara

2 Q. And then you signed off on it?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. And you were doing this at the  
5 behest of the Speaker?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. In the name of the Speaker?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. And the Speaker had full knowledge  
10 of the content of both letters?

11 A. I don't know that she actually saw  
12 the letter, but she had knowledge generally of  
13 the content, yes.

14 Q. And she approved you signing it?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. You had to check with her before you  
17 signed it?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. And if she had said do not sign it,  
20 you would not have signed it?

21 A. Correct.

22 MR. WAREHAM: Off the record.

23 (Discussion held off the record.)

24 Q. Following the May 30th stated  
25 meeting, did the Speaker have a meeting to assess

1 C. Meara

2 the disruption caused by Ms. Plummer's outburst  
3 and threats?

4 A. I -- I don't know that we had a  
5 specific meeting to assess the outburst and  
6 threats.

7 Q. Do you remember having a meeting  
8 with Wayne Kawadler and other senior staff  
9 members concerning the response to Ms. Plummer?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Do you remember when that was?

12 A. There was a series of meetings in  
13 the immediate aftermath, so I can't tell you  
14 which meeting occurred on which date.

15 Q. Did you attend all of those  
16 meetings?

17 A. I -- I would assume that I did, yes,  
18 but I'm not sure.

19 Q. Can you, to the best of your  
20 recollection, detail, if you don't remember the  
21 exact dates, when the meetings were, who attended  
22 the separate meetings, those different meetings?

23 A. There were meetings in the days that  
24 followed, some were attended by the General  
25 Counsel's office, some were attended by

1 C. Meara

2 administrative staff.

3 Q. And what was discussed at those  
4 meetings?

5 MR. MARKS: I am going to object to  
6 the extent that it calls for him to state  
7 what occurred at the meetings that were  
8 attended by the General Counsel's office  
9 that would be protected by the  
10 attorney-client privilege.

11 But if you can answer the questions  
12 about other meetings that were not attended  
13 by the General Counsel's office, that is  
14 fine.

15 A. I don't specifically recall if there  
16 were meetings at the General Counsel's office, I  
17 didn't participate in them so I just don't know  
18 the answer to that. But in a general way we  
19 discussed options that were available that the  
20 General Counsel's office had been asked to  
21 research.

22 Q. And would it be fair to say that  
23 your view of the principal obstacle being whether  
24 or not the Speaker had the authority over the  
25 individual staff member of an individual counsel



C. Meara

member?

MR. MARKS: Object to the form of  
the question.

You can answer.

A. I don't know that we viewed it as an  
obstacle, we viewed it as a question.

Q. It was viewed as a question because  
it wasn't clearly set out anyplace?

A. It wasn't clearly set out in  
anyplace in either way.

Q. And it was a question because it had  
never happened before?

A. Correct.

Q. And the focus of the discussion was  
around Ms. Plummer's statements around Council  
member Comrie?

A. And the conduct at the stated  
meeting.

Q. Are you saying that they were looked  
at as co-equal, equally?

A. I'm not saying either one, you asked  
a question and I'm just trying to be -- both  
element were part of the discussions, I don't  
know whether one was more than the other.

1 C. Meara

2 Q. And was a concern of the Speaker  
3 from the beginning with both the conduct inside  
4 and the statement of Council Member Comrie?

5 MR. MARKS: About?

6 Q. About --

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. -- Mrs. Plummer's conduct?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. And are you saying that Ms.  
11 Plummer's conduct inside of City Hall was the  
12 basis upon which she was terminated?

13 MR. MARKS: I just want to -- do you  
14 mean --

15 Q. The stated meeting on May 30th?

16 MR. MARKS: The stated meeting of  
17 May 30, 2007?

18 Q. The stated meeting of May 30, 2007?

19 MR. WAREHAM: Thank you.

20 A. I didn't say that.

21 Q. I'm asking you.

22 A. I think it's a combination.

23 Q. If it's a combination does one have  
24 predominance over the other in your view?

25 A. Not really.

1 C. Meara

2 Q. I'll ask you a hypothetical, had Ms.  
3 Plummer not made the remarks concerning Council  
4 Member Comrie, do you think that she would have  
5 faced termination for her conduct inside of City  
6 Hall on May 30, 2007?

7 MR. MARKS: I will object, because  
8 it really does call for a speculation  
9 rather than him to answer. The question is  
10 what would be the basis for her suspension  
11 and termination and he testified to it,  
12 he's not here to speculate.

13 Q. I'll try to be a little bit more  
14 concrete. Would you say that more weight was  
15 attributed to Ms. Plummer's statement in terms  
16 of --

17 MR. WAREHAM: Withdrawn.

18 Q. On a scale, if we look at Ms.  
19 Plummer's conduct inside the City Council on May  
20 30, 2007 and the statement outside, which was  
21 statements as well, outside the City Council in  
22 2007, which do you think had more weight in terms  
23 of decision to discipline her?

24 MR. MARKS: Objection to form, but  
25 you can answer.

1 C. Meara

2 A. Again, I would say both, but in the  
3 immediate aftermath we were particularly  
4 concerned about the assassination comment.

5 Q. Would you say that that one carried  
6 more weight?

7 A. In the beginning it was a more  
8 immediate concern.

9 Q. And that concern was demonstrated by  
10 the assignment of the security detail to Council  
11 Member Comrie?

12 MR. MARKS: Objection to form.

13 You can answer.

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. And the concern around Ms. Plummer's  
16 conduct in the City Council on May 30, 2007 was  
17 demonstrated by what?

18 A. I don't understand.

19 Q. If Ms. Plummer's conduct inside City  
20 Hall was as serious as that alleged by the --  
21 caused by the remarks, what steps were taken  
22 inside City Hall that day to address her conduct?

23 A. Well, I -- we asked the General  
24 Counsel's office to begin exploring what options  
25 were available to us.

1 C. Meara

2 Q. Maybe my question isn't clear. What  
3 steps were taken inside the City Council that day  
4 at the time that the disruptive comment happened  
5 to address that?

6 A. Well, once the meeting was over, we  
7 went downstairs and were talking about the  
8 Council meeting, and at that time the  
9 assassination comment was brought to our  
10 attention, so the focus quickly shifted from the  
11 disruption in the chamber to the assassination  
12 comment.

13 Q. But during the meeting itself, no  
14 steps were taken to address that?

15 A. Well, as I said much earlier, once  
16 the -- I mean the meeting proceeded.

17 Q. Right. The meeting proceeded and  
18 the work was completed?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. And Ms. Plummer attended two  
21 subsequent stated meetings where nothing  
22 happened --

23 A. I believe I said I don't know  
24 whether she did.

25 Q. Do you remember getting an e-mail

1 C. Meara

2 from Carl D'Alba on July 2nd as to how we should  
3 handle Ms. Plummer in the future?

4 A. No, I don't.

5 MR. WAREHAM: This will be  
6 Plaintiffs' Exhibit 12, it is Bates marked  
7 D 0842.

8 (Plaintiff's Exhibit 12, document  
9 bearing Bates number D 0842, marked for  
10 identification.)

11 Q. Would you look at that, please?

12 A. Okay.

13 Q. Do you remember having looked at  
14 that, do you remember that message now?

15 A. Not really.

16 Q. Do you know, based on that message,  
17 do you remember any meeting occurring on how you  
18 attended to handle Ms. Plummer?

19 A. I don't remember specifically, but  
20 assume we had a meeting.

21 Q. Do you know what the decision was  
22 around that, this is on July 2nd?

23 A. I don't remember specifically what  
24 the result of any discussion that I had with Carl  
25 was.

1 C. Meara

2 Q. Was there any policy that was  
3 developed prior to Ms. Plummer's termination as  
4 to how she was going to be handled by security?

5 A. Not specific to Ms. Plummer that I  
6 recall.

7 MR. WAREHAM: I'm almost finished,  
8 let's take a five minute break.

9 (Time noted: 2:39 p.m.)

10 (A brief recess is taken.)

11 (Time noted: 2:44 p.m.)

12 MR. WAREHAM: I have no further  
13 questions.

14 MR. MARKS: I have no questions.

15 (Time noted: 2:44 p.m.)  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C. Meara

I, the witness herein, having read  
the foregoing testimony, do hereby certify  
it to be a true and correct transcript,  
subject to the corrections, if any, shown  
on the attached page.

-----  
CHARLES MEARA

Subscribed and sworn to  
before me this \_\_\_\_ day  
of \_\_\_\_\_ 2007.



L. Comrie

CERTIFICATE

STATE OF NEW YORK )

:

COUNTY OF NEW YORK)

I, KAREN PERLMAN, a Shorthand Reporter and  
Notary Public within and for the State of New  
York, do hereby certify:

That CHARLES MEARA, the witness whose  
deposition is hereinbefore set forth, was duly  
sworn by me and that such deposition is a true  
record of the testimony given by such witness.

I further certify that I am not related to  
any of the parties to this action by blood or  
marriage, and that I am in no way interested in  
the outcome of this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my  
hand this 20th day of August, 2007.



KAREN PERLMAN

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C. Meara

INDEX

WITNESS	EXAMINATION BY	PAGE
CHARLES MEARA	MR. WAREHAM	4

EXHIBITS

PLAINTIFF'S	EXHIBIT	PAGE	LINE
12	Document bearing.....	61	8
	Bates number D 0842		

A		B		
ability 5:6	approved 8:19		38:1 39:1 40:1	20:24 25:20,22
able 39:21	53:14	B 51:22	41:1 42:1 43:1	46:23 47:2 60:2
acceptable 33:22	approves 9:4	back 9:3 48:3 51:23	44:1 45:1 46:1	cleared 17:20,22,23
accused 28:10 47:3	April 9:9	balcony 17:4 19:25	47:1 48:1 49:1	clearly 5:7 17:16
acknowledging	area 20:17 21:6	25:7,11,12	50:1 51:1 52:1	56:9,10
41:14	22:21 23:3,7	Barron 18:15 31:13	53:1 54:1 55:1	college 6:12,16
act 17:19	areas 38:18	31:16,25 32:10,10	56:1 57:1 58:1	combination 57:22
action 1:5 4:15 38:8	Arms 21:14 27:21	32:13 45:15	59:1 60:1 61:1	57:23
45:7 52:17 64:14	27:24	Barron's 26:14	62:1 63:1 65:1	come 8:7 28:12,17
actions 18:20 23:15	arrive 45:18 48:21	based 61:16	cab 24:25	29:20
address 4:3 20:14	aside 28:7 36:7	basically 15:14 35:4	call 20:2 25:12 58:8	comes 7:11
27:12 47:21 59:22	asked 21:22 22:7,13	basis 12:6,8,9 46:3	called 16:10 29:19	coming 20:25
60:5,14	23:5 29:16,18,20	57:12 58:10	29:21	comment 36:12
administrative 6:24	30:5,6 36:15,16	Bates 61:6,9 65:8	calls 25:16 55:6	59:4 60:4,9,12
7:8,18 50:16 51:4	37:9 45:11 48:24	bearing 61:9 65:8	career 34:19	comments 21:8 22:3
55:2	55:20 56:22 59:23	beginning 57:3 59:7	Carl 22:16 61:2,24	22:6
advise 8:6 31:24	asking 20:13 57:21	begun 3:14	carried 59:5	commission 24:22
32:3	ass 28:15 29:8	behalf 17:19	Carson 9:7 10:17	28:8
advised 35:14,16	assassinate 30:18	behavior 24:3,5	19:5	committed 41:15
advisor 15:25	31:4 32:19 33:23	behest 53:5	Carson's 9:19,24	committee 8:24 9:3
Advocate 13:5,15	assassination 28:14	believe 9:9 11:14,19	11:5 23:17	9:9,13,18,22
13:25 14:4,20	29:7 33:8 34:3,4,8	11:22 17:8 27:9	case 21:5 40:3	10:15,16,21,24
15:17 16:6,7	34:11,14,19 36:12	27:14 28:2 35:9	caused 27:12 54:2	12:11 25:25 26:3
17:12,16,18 21:23	59:4 60:9,11	36:15 39:17,23	59:21	26:16,21,23 27:20
25:16	assess 53:25 54:5	40:13 42:4 44:21	causing 21:16	28:5,9
aftermath 54:13	assignment 59:10	60:23	central 45:15	complaint 35:12,19
59:3	assume 54:17 61:20	best 54:19	certain 27:6 39:14	36:5 39:6 44:19
afternoon 4:10,11	assuming 9:4	better 47:6	CERTIFICATE	45:2
agency 46:9,9 48:14	attached 31:4 63:6	bit 58:13	64:2	complete 23:22
48:18	attained 6:11	blackout 33:14,17	certify 63:3 64:8,13	completed 28:20
agenda 23:23	attend 54:15	blood 64:14	cetera 12:13	45:25 60:18
agree 42:17	attended 17:2 54:21	body 48:7	chair 12:9 28:3	completing 43:15
agreed 3:3,7,10 30:9	54:24,25 55:8,12	box 34:21	chairing 27:8,10,10	completion 40:5
39:18,20 41:2	60:20 61:18	BRAGG 2:20	chairperson 11:23	compliance 42:21
agreeing 41:15	attention 26:4,8,13	break 5:9 62:8	chairs 27:14	composed 52:22
agreement 41:14	26:20,22 28:12,18	Brennan 29:21,25	challenged 41:6	Comrie 29:19,24
alleged 59:20	28:22,25 46:21	30:5,7	chamber 18:11	30:3,8,10 31:4
allows 49:9	47:22 60:10	brief 62:10	60:11	35:8,11 45:2
ALVIN 2:20	attorneys 2:4,10,17	bring 27:15	chambers 17:4	56:17 57:4 58:4
amendment 23:16	3:4	broad 30:21 31:5	chapters 47:20	59:11 64:1
amount 6:17	attorney-client 49:5	Broadway 2:18	character 34:3,8	Comrie's 28:15 29:8
and/or 45:19	55:10	Brooklyn 2:6	CHARLES 1:15	Con 33:10,15
answer 4:25 5:6	attributed 58:15	brought 26:3,8,13	63:12 64:9 65:4	conceding 34:15
7:15 13:22 16:17	attributing 24:6	26:20,22 28:24	chart 7:17,18,20	concern 30:21,22
20:7 21:21 29:12	August 1:11 64:18	44:19 45:2 52:18	Charter 46:12,13	31:5,7 45:6 57:2
30:20 34:7,25	authority 6:3 17:14	60:9	47:20	59:8,9,15
35:22,23 37:7,25	37:2,9,11,13,17	building 16:20	check 53:16	concerned 29:17
43:11 45:10,22	37:22 38:4 39:24	business 4:2	Chief 5:15,20 6:2,21	36:25 46:13 59:4
49:13 52:24 55:11	43:3 45:19 46:3		8:5 24:9	concerning 10:17
55:18 56:5 58:9	46:10 48:11 49:9		CHRISTINE 1:7	10:22 28:14 50:8
58:25 59:13	55:24		Church 1:17 2:11	54:9 58:3
anybody 49:7	available 36:17	C 2:2 4:1,2 5:1 6:1	City 1:8 2:8,15 4:3	concerns 10:22
anyplace 56:9,11	45:13 48:25 55:19	7:1 8:1 9:1 10:1	5:16 7:18 13:6	13:25 15:5,9,14
approach 31:12	59:25	11:1 12:1 13:1	29:22 32:19 33:24	conclusion 45:18
32:9,15	Avenue 1:23 2:5	14:1 15:1 16:1	34:2 44:15 46:12	concrete 58:14
approached 32:12	aware 7:19 9:7,11	17:1 18:1 19:1	46:13 47:20 48:8	conduct 18:24 19:3
approaching 31:15	9:15,21 16:16	20:1 21:1 22:1	48:18,18 49:11,16	19:23 20:5 21:19
appropriate 42:9	18:16,17 25:25	23:1 24:1 25:1	57:11 58:5,19,21	24:12 28:10 56:18
approval 50:14	26:7 35:8,13 43:7	26:1 27:1 28:1	59:16,19,22 60:3	57:3,8,11 58:5,19
approve 50:17	43:13,18,22 44:11	29:1 30:1 31:1	civil 1:5 26:21 28:7	59:16,19,22
	45:4,5 50:21 51:2	32:1 33:1 34:1	clear 10:13 17:14	conference 29:6
		35:1 36:1 37:1		

32:17 33:4 34:14  
34:15,16 47:13,17  
consider 31:15,21  
considered 31:20,23  
consisted 19:3  
contact 10:20  
contacted 10:23  
content 4:22 51:13  
52:7,21 53:10,13  
context 34:4  
continued 42:24  
control 49:10,10,18  
controversial 15:12  
copy 29:18  
Corporation 1:17  
2:9  
correct 28:6 33:25  
34:12 40:24 45:16  
48:20 53:21 56:14  
63:4  
corrections 63:5  
Council 1:8 2:15  
5:14,16 6:18 7:18  
8:2,17,19,20 9:3  
11:8,15 12:18,22  
13:6,20,23 15:11  
18:20 20:2 21:2  
23:22 24:2,11  
25:13 26:6 33:18  
35:8,11 37:4 38:7  
38:20 40:15 41:24  
42:23 43:9,20,24  
44:15,25 45:8,15  
46:5,7,8,13 47:21  
48:6,7,13,18 49:6  
49:11,16 50:5,12  
50:17 56:16 57:4  
58:3,19,21 59:10  
59:16 60:3,8  
Councilman 18:15  
23:16 26:14 27:9  
27:10 28:14 29:8  
29:19,24 30:3,8  
30:10 31:4,13,16  
31:25 32:9,10,13  
33:10,14 38:12,14  
39:8,12,15 41:5  
42:8  
Councilmen 23:10  
counsel 1:17 2:9,16  
36:16 37:13 55:25  
Counsel's 37:10  
45:12,24 48:24  
49:6 51:14 52:6  
52:25 54:25 55:8  
55:13,16,20 59:24  
COUNTY 64:5  
couple 4:16  
course 18:17 19:4  
27:5 40:19 41:2  
41:19

COURT 1:2  
co-equal 56:21  
co-naming 8:10,14  
23:17,20  
crowd 21:24,25 22:8  
CV 1:6

**D**  
D 39:9 61:7,9 65:8  
date 26:17 45:23  
54:14  
dated 18:19 52:9,19  
dates 38:12 54:21  
day 14:6,7,8 17:6,22  
18:4 23:23 24:2  
25:4 30:23 59:22  
60:3 63:16 64:18  
days 54:23  
dealt 38:3  
decision 58:23  
61:21  
Defendant 1:9 2:10  
2:17  
defendants 51:17  
Defendant's 51:22  
definition 7:7  
degree 6:12  
demonstrated 59:9  
59:17  
department 2:8  
35:12,20 39:7  
40:5  
deposed 4:17  
deposition 1:15 3:9  
3:11,14 46:17  
64:10,11  
derives 48:10  
describe 19:2  
detail 54:20 59:10  
determine 10:24  
developed 62:3  
different 8:7 54:22  
directed 20:16 21:8  
22:4  
directing 21:2,4,5  
directive 31:8,11  
directly 22:13  
director 22:13  
disapprove 50:19  
discipline 36:19,21  
37:2,14,22 38:5  
39:4,12,16,22  
40:4,18 42:7,25  
43:8,15 48:11  
58:23  
disciplined 38:6,18  
39:13  
discretionary 12:24  
discrimination  
44:16,22  
discussed 19:6 30:2

55:3,19  
discussion 24:21  
35:15 40:14 47:15  
50:2 51:20 52:16  
53:23 56:15 61:24  
discussions 9:17  
50:8 56:24  
disrupt 23:19  
disrupted 19:6  
disruption 20:9,24  
21:16 24:20 25:3  
25:6 26:11 27:4  
27:12 28:4 54:2  
60:11  
disruptions 25:24  
26:2,5 44:8  
disruptive 18:20,23  
19:3,23,25 20:5  
21:19 23:15 24:2  
24:5,12,15 26:15  
28:10 60:4  
distinguishing 25:7  
district 1:2,2 39:9  
39:11  
division 7:9 50:16  
document 61:8 65:8  
DOI 42:5  
doing 31:21,23 53:4  
DOI's 39:9  
downstairs 60:7  
draw 46:21 47:21  
duly 4:4 64:10  
D'Alba 22:16 61:2

**E**  
E 2:2,2 4:2,2  
earlier 43:16 60:15  
early 45:6  
Ed 33:11,15  
education 6:11  
effect 42:20  
either 4:21 56:11,22  
elect 49:16  
elected 49:21  
election 49:22 50:3  
50:4,7  
element 56:24  
emotional 30:23  
emotions 15:12  
employee 37:3  
employment 43:23  
48:12  
enact 39:21  
enacted 38:16 39:5  
enforce 42:25  
engaged 19:22  
ensure 8:4  
entail 7:2 40:8  
enters 47:16  
entire 17:24 23:20  
equally 56:21

escort 27:24  
ESQ 2:3,13,20  
et 12:13  
evening 35:10 36:8  
36:11  
event 30:8  
exact 38:11 45:23  
54:21  
EXAMINATION  
4:8 65:3  
examined 3:12 4:5  
excerpts 47:19  
excuse 46:19  
Exhibit 46:16 47:19  
61:6,8 65:7  
EXHIBITS 65:6  
explain 32:25  
explained 32:16  
33:3 34:13,18  
explanation 32:21  
33:6,22  
exploring 59:24  
expressed 45:6  
extent 49:3 55:6  
extraordinary  
16:13,21  
e-mail 60:25

**F**  
face 20:4 28:4 42:17  
faced 58:5  
facing 18:10  
fair 8:16 55:22  
familiar 8:13 15:22  
33:13 44:14 46:11  
51:25  
far 17:17  
fellow 49:17  
felt 30:11  
file 35:11  
filed 35:19 39:6  
filing 3:8 36:5  
fine 4:12 55:14  
finished 62:7  
fire 37:18  
firing 36:20 49:19  
firm 45:18  
first 4:4 8:22 18:14  
24:14,16 42:8  
48:4  
five 62:8  
floor 1:23 20:2,25  
22:5,9 25:12,13  
25:21,23  
flow 7:17,20  
focus 56:15 60:10  
focused 34:10  
followed 54:24  
Following 53:24  
follows 4:6  
foregoing 63:3

form 3:6 4:22 7:14  
13:21 16:15 20:6  
21:20 29:11 30:19  
31:9 34:6,24  
35:21 37:6,24  
43:8,10 45:9,21  
49:12 52:23 56:3  
58:24 59:12  
forth 64:10  
forward 23:18,21  
Foster 11:23  
Four 19:11  
front 18:11,15  
full 8:19,20 9:3  
46:24 53:9  
funds 12:24  
further 3:7,10 10:9  
62:12 64:13  
future 61:3

**G**  
Gallagher 11:16  
gallery 17:4 25:4,9  
25:11,17  
gavel 20:9,12 27:15  
general 2:16 23:3,7  
36:16 37:9,12  
45:11,24 48:24  
49:6 51:14 52:6  
52:25 54:24 55:8  
55:13,16,18,20  
59:23  
generally 7:12 13:2  
50:17 53:12  
genie 34:20  
getting 37:12 60:25  
Gifford 5:23  
give 13:14 41:4  
given 32:19,19  
64:12  
gives 49:9,10  
giving 49:18  
go 8:23 22:23 23:5  
goes 7:21 8:4 50:15  
going 5:7 10:4,10  
15:11 22:14 30:18  
31:2 47:5 48:2  
55:5 62:4  
Good 4:10,11,13  
Gothaum 46:17,20  
great 12:23  
GREENHOUSE  
1:23  
guess 51:17

**H**  
H 4:2  
half 5:22  
Hall 4:3 29:22 32:19  
33:24 34:3 57:11  
58:6 59:20,22

hand 18:11 64:18	inflammatory 32:20	20:21 21:23 22:3	25:19,22 29:11	25:6 26:21 27:2,6
handle 61:3,18	influence 12:23	22:12,18,19,23	30:19 31:9 32:8	27:8,15,25 28:7
handled 62:4	informing 51:8	23:6,10 24:23	34:6,24 35:21,23	28:19 44:9 53:25
happen 17:9	input 51:12 52:5	26:25 27:7,18,23	37:6,15,24 41:7	53:25 54:5,7,14
happened 9:12	inside 57:3,11 58:5	31:19,22,25 32:5	41:10 43:10 45:9	56:19 57:15,16,18
29:23 56:13 60:4	58:19 59:19,22	32:6 33:12,17,18	45:21 46:22,25	60:6,8,13,16,17
60:22	60:3	33:20 35:14,16	47:9,14 49:3,12	61:17,20
harassment 44:15	insisted 42:10	36:2,6,23 37:8,19	51:19 52:14,23	meetings 7:25 13:2
44:22 45:2	instance 43:17	40:10 41:17,17,18	55:5 56:3 57:5,13	13:4,11 14:24,24
head 5:2 29:21 46:7	instances 43:6,12,18	41:18,22 42:14,15	57:16 58:7,24	17:2 24:10,11
46:8,9 48:14	43:22	43:14 44:18,25	59:12 62:14	25:25 26:3,16,24
hear 31:3	instruct 51:7	47:3 49:20 50:15	marriage 64:15	27:20 28:9 44:2
heard 19:16,17	instructions 13:14	51:4,15 53:11	matter 15:10 19:5	44:11 54:12,16,21
hearing 40:11	interested 64:15	54:4 55:17 56:6	30:2,4 38:15	54:22,22,23 55:4
held 14:24 47:15	interfering 28:5	56:25 60:23 61:16	44:21 49:5 64:16	55:7,12,16 60:21
51:20 52:16 53:23	intergovernmental	61:21	matters 16:21	member 6:25 11:8
Helen 11:23	6:6	knowledge 9:16,20	McMahon 38:22,23	11:15 12:18,22
hereinbefore 64:10	interpret 29:9	15:4 28:9,11 53:9	38:25 39:12,15	26:12 35:8,11
hereto 3:5	interrupt 52:14	53:12	40:15 41:5,7,8,9	37:4 38:5,5,7,12
hereunto 64:17	intervene 10:10		McMahon's 38:13	38:13,20 39:13
hidden 31:8,11	interviews 40:9		mean 16:22 27:16	40:9,15,25 41:13
high 30:24	introduced 12:12	L 2:20 4:2 64:1	29:10,15 32:8	41:20 42:3,5,11
highest 6:10	investigation 39:9	lamp 33:16	44:23 50:4 57:14	42:12,23 43:20,24
hire 50:12,14	40:5,6,8,12 42:5	law 1:16 2:3,8	60:16	44:25 45:8,15
hired 50:23	Investigations 39:7	lawyer 46:6	means 7:6 29:17	46:4,5 49:11
hires 50:17,20	involve 40:14,21	leaves 47:12	44:24	50:12,18 55:25
history 6:14 32:20	involved 8:9,14 9:17	left 18:11	meant 31:18 32:23	56:2,17 57:4 58:4
honest 14:16 42:6	26:5,12 40:9,11	legal 52:17	34:18	59:11
hours 41:21	40:18 41:13 42:20	legislative 6:24 48:7	Meara 1:15 4:1,10	members 6:25 9:17
hypothetical 58:2	50:11	Leticia 11:9	5:1 6:1 7:1 8:1 9:1	10:16,20,23 11:20
	involvement 40:17	letter 18:18 51:7,10	10:1 11:1 12:1	13:19,23 19:8,9
I	involves 8:17	51:13 52:3,7,9,18	13:1 14:1 15:1	26:6,6,14 38:3,16
identification 61:10	involving 41:23	52:21 53:12	16:1 17:1 18:1	43:9 48:12,13
immediate 54:13	42:2	letters 53:10	19:1 20:1 21:1	49:16,17,20 50:5
59:3,8	issue 10:17,25 12:16	let's 62:8	22:1 23:1 24:1	54:9
immediately 29:20	15:13 24:25	level 6:10	25:1 26:1 27:1	mentioned 48:23
37:21	issued 33:23	Liar 19:17	28:1 29:1 30:1	message 61:14,16
impair 5:6	issues 8:7	Lieutenant 29:21,25	31:1 32:1 33:1	Miller 5:23
imposed 42:7 43:8		30:5,7	34:1 35:1 36:1	minute 62:8
43:14	J	light 33:11	37:1 38:1 39:1	months 6:19
impropriety 41:15	James 11:9,9 12:19	Limousine 24:22	40:1 41:1 42:1	motion 12:12
inappropriately	12:22	LINE 65:7	43:1 44:1 45:1	
39:10	Jersey 6:4	little 58:13	46:1 47:1 48:1	N
incident 39:3 41:23	Joel 41:24,25	long 5:17 6:8 35:7	49:1 50:1 51:1	N 2:2
42:2	JR 2:20	41:19	52:1 53:1 54:1	name 4:14 9:6,7,13
include 23:16 36:20	July 52:19 61:2,22	look 51:25 58:18	55:1 56:1 57:1	9:19,24 10:4,7,10
included 9:24 11:6	June 18:19 44:3	61:11	58:1 59:1 60:1	10:13 11:5 23:17
35:3	45:6 51:6 52:10	looked 56:20 61:13	61:1 62:1 63:1,12	53:7
includes 6:23,24	52:12	lot 15:12 16:22	64:9 65:1,4	names 8:17
including 10:7	K		measures 16:14	nature 27:4 30:14
independent 45:8	Karen 1:18 64:6,24	M 4:2	36:8	39:3,4
INDEX 65:2	Kawadler 15:22	maintaining 13:3,15	medications 5:5	near 8:3 13:11
indicate 10:9 11:4	54:8	making 20:19 22:5	meet 14:19	18:14,15
11:11,24 12:3,14	kept 20:13	22:9 47:3	meeting 9:22 10:14	necessarily 14:23
12:18 30:10	knew 15:10 30:24	Maris 6:16	11:13 13:16,18,19	necessary 50:23
indicated 9:23 10:3	know 5:10 10:15,18	marked 46:15 51:21	13:20,24 14:2,3,5	need 5:9
10:6 12:2 38:4	12:10,11 13:4	61:6,9	14:22 15:2,6,16	never 12:17 32:25
individual 26:6 37:4	14:15 15:2,20	MARKS 2:13 7:13	16:5,9,11,14	41:4,5 42:19 43:2
38:7 43:8,19,24	16:18,20,21,23	13:21 16:15,17	17:13,25 18:4,21	46:14 56:13
46:4 48:12,13	17:11,15,17 18:13	20:6 21:20 25:10	19:4,6 24:14,16	New 1:2,18,18,20,24
49:19 55:25,25			24:17,18,24,24	1:24 2:6,8,12,12

2:15,19,19 4:3,3 6:4,4,7 44:14 46:12 47:19 48:18 48:19 64:3,5,7 night 30:9 36:15 noise 20:20 22:9 nominally 49:10 norm 14:23 Notary 1:19 3:13,13 4:5 64:7 noted 62:9,11,15 Notice 1:16 number 19:7,10 20:8 23:9 26:14 26:15 38:3 61:9 65:8 NYPD 16:19,25 17:3 29:22	59:24 orally 4:25 order 13:3 21:14 Ordinarily 15:19 outburst 54:2,5 outcome 64:16 outside 58:20,21 overall 6:22 16:19 oversight 7:4,6,7	31:16 32:2,11,15 37:3,14,18,23 38:8 44:5,19 45:3 45:7,14,20 51:8 52:4,19 54:9 58:3 60:20 61:3,18 62:5 Plummer's 20:5 23:14 36:11 54:2 56:16 57:8,11 58:15,19 59:15,19 62:3 point 8:18 21:22 22:12 28:13 33:13 36:7,21 42:19 43:2 45:17 51:6 52:11 pole 11:2 police 35:12,20 policy 38:15 44:15 44:20 45:3 62:2 political 6:14 33:8 34:13,19,19 Port 6:3 position 5:13,18 8:5 10:12,25 11:25 12:5,20 32:25 34:20 36:3 48:13 post 33:11,16 Poughkeepsie 6:16 predominance 57:24 preliminary 4:16 preparation 13:20 prerogative 28:3 presence 17:3,7 present 2:23 14:10 27:21 49:22 50:5 presiding 17:13 20:4 press 29:5 32:17 33:4 34:14,15,16 prevent 23:15 previous 5:21 principal 55:23 prior 5:25 9:6,11,21 10:14,21 11:12 13:18 14:20,24 24:18,24 37:12 38:8 50:7 62:3 privilege 55:10 privileged 49:5 Probably 14:8,11 problem 9:23 procedure 8:9,13 proceeded 60:16,17 property 33:24 protected 55:9 provisions 46:12 public 1:19 3:13,13 4:5 13:5,14,24	14:3,20 15:17 16:6,7 17:12,16 17:18 21:23 25:16 26:22 28:8 64:7 pursuant 1:16 44:19 45:3 put 51:16,17,24 Putnam 2:5 p.m 1:11 62:9,11,15	remember 14:6,9,14 15:15 16:9,10 17:9 18:6,18 21:10,12 25:18 26:10 29:2 38:11 42:6 44:5 54:7,11 54:20 60:25 61:13 61:14,17,19,23 remembered 16:4 remind 12:22 removal 9:6,11,18 remove 21:15 removed 9:8,13 10:4,10 24:2 renaming 8:10 19:5 repeat 48:2 repeatedly 20:10 rephrase 4:23 report 7:10 Reporter 1:19 64:6 REPORTING 1:23 represent 4:15 request 20:15 42:21 required 34:21 35:2 35:5 39:13 requirement 38:16 research 37:10 45:12,25 48:24 55:21 reserved 3:6 resist 42:24 resisted 42:8 respective 3:4 response 33:9 34:5 34:22 35:2,5 54:9 responsibilities 6:20 7:3,5,25 50:2,9 responsibility 6:22 responsible 13:3 result 43:15 61:24 right 8:4 20:20 23:10 25:14,15 30:16 34:17 40:7 40:20 46:25 51:24 60:17 rights 26:21 28:8 Rivera 41:24,25 42:8,23 Rivera's 38:14 Roger 2:3 4:14 room 17:14,20,22 19:22 47:8,10,13 47:17 roughly 19:13 row 18:12,14 rules 13:7
<b>O</b> oath 4:6,20 object 43:10 49:3 55:5 56:3 58:7 Objection 7:13,13 13:21 16:15 20:6 21:20 29:11 30:19 31:9 34:6,24 35:21 37:6,15,24 45:9,21 49:12 52:23 58:24 59:12 objections 3:5 47:4 observe 18:3 obstacle 55:23 56:7 occasion 39:11 occasions 38:2 occurred 24:24 54:14 55:7 occurring 21:19 61:17 office 2:9,16 13:9 14:12 28:23 29:20 29:24,25 36:15,16 37:10 39:9,11 40:2 43:5 45:12 45:24 48:24 49:6 51:3,14 52:6,25 54:25 55:8,13,16 55:20 59:24 officer 20:4 offices 1:17 2:3 okay 5:12 25:23 47:24 49:8 61:12 once 11:14,19,21,23 12:7 20:16 21:2 33:23 43:3 60:6 60:15 opinion 30:6 35:24 37:12 opposed 12:15 options 36:17,18,24 45:12 48:25 55:19	<b>P</b> P 2:2,2 package 8:18,22 9:8 9:14,19,25 10:5,7 10:11,13 11:6 23:17,20 page 63:6 65:3,7 paperwork 50:15 50:23 Parks 8:23 9:2,8,12 9:17,22 10:14,21 10:23 part 12:8 14:5 45:6 56:24 participate 39:14 55:17 particular 7:24 15:5 19:8 40:3 particularly 59:3 parties 3:5 64:14 passions 30:24 PAUL 2:13 penalty 12:15 people 8:18 16:23 19:24 51:5 Perlman 1:18 64:6 64:24 perquisite 12:19 person 21:7,9,15 26:15 49:18 50:23 personally 26:4 31:17 50:24 personnel 7:2,4 pertained 40:16 petty 24:25 physically 30:11 place 20:25 Plaintiff 1:5,16 2:4 Plaintiffs 61:6 Plaintiff's 46:16 47:18 61:8 65:7 please 19:2 20:20 61:11 Plummer 1:4 2:24 4:15 18:3,16,19 20:15,17 21:15 22:2,4,21 23:2,5 23:11 24:6 26:15 27:4,13,24 28:10 28:13 29:6 30:11 30:17,22 31:6,12	<b>Q</b> Queens 33:14,18 question 30:15,25 31:3 42:12 56:4,7 56:8,12,23 58:9 60:2 questions 4:17,21 55:11 62:13,14 quickly 60:10 quiet 20:9,13,15,20 21:9,23,25,25 22:7 27:15 Quinn 1:7 21:18 49:23 quote 45:8 quote/unquote 19:23 23:14 34:15	<b>R</b> R 2:2 4:2,2 read 46:14 47:22 48:4 63:2 really 30:17,24 35:24 57:25 58:8 61:15 recall 19:19 23:13 45:23 55:15 62:6 recess 62:10 recognize 52:2,3 recollection 17:22 23:25 49:25 54:20 record 5:2 25:20 47:2,14,15 51:19 51:20 52:15,16 53:22,23 64:12 Recreation 9:9,13 9:22 10:21,24 Recreations 8:23 9:2,18 10:15 referred 43:16 referring 18:20 regarding 44:22 regularly 8:23 related 64:13 remark 28:13 29:4 29:10 31:13,17 32:11 remarks 19:7 20:17 32:2,14,16,23,24 58:3 59:21 remedy 40:4	remember 14:6,9,14 15:15 16:9,10 17:9 18:6,18 21:10,12 25:18 26:10 29:2 38:11 42:6 44:5 54:7,11 54:20 60:25 61:13 61:14,17,19,23 remembered 16:4 remind 12:22 removal 9:6,11,18 remove 21:15 removed 9:8,13 10:4,10 24:2 renaming 8:10 19:5 repeat 48:2 repeatedly 20:10 rephrase 4:23 report 7:10 Reporter 1:19 64:6 REPORTING 1:23 represent 4:15 request 20:15 42:21 required 34:21 35:2 35:5 39:13 requirement 38:16 research 37:10 45:12,25 48:24 55:21 reserved 3:6 resist 42:24 resisted 42:8 respective 3:4 response 33:9 34:5 34:22 35:2,5 54:9 responsibilities 6:20 7:3,5,25 50:2,9 responsibility 6:22 responsible 13:3 result 43:15 61:24 right 8:4 20:20 23:10 25:14,15 30:16 34:17 40:7 40:20 46:25 51:24 60:17 rights 26:21 28:8 Rivera 41:24,25 42:8,23 Rivera's 38:14 Roger 2:3 4:14 room 17:14,20,22 19:22 47:8,10,13 47:17 roughly 19:13 row 18:12,14 rules 13:7
				<b>S</b> S 2:2,3 4:2 safety 26:22 28:8 satisfactory 33:2



saw 22:22,23 23:3 53:11	sit 23:10	42:11 43:9,19,23	T	13:13 19:7,10
saying 10:9 14:22 30:25 33:19,20,21 56:20,22 57:10	sits 18:15	45:15 46:4 48:12	taboo 34:2	20:8 27:6
scale 58:18	sitting 23:11,12	49:11,19 50:13	take 5:9 20:4 27:12 30:12,13 31:10 36:10 41:2,20 42:7 62:8	Tish 11:8
scheduled 23:23	Sonny 9:7,19,24 10:17 11:5 19:5 23:16	54:8 55:2,25	taken 1:15 5:5 16:14 32:24 36:8 38:8 42:25 59:21 60:3 60:14 62:10	today 5:7
science 6:14	stand 8:3	standing 18:10	talk 31:25	told 15:21 16:3 27:3 29:3,5 39:17
Seabrook 27:9	state 1:20 55:6 64:3 64:7	stated 7:25 13:2,3 13:10,10,18,20 14:2,20,24,25 15:5 17:24 18:21 24:11,16,17 25:6 25:13 28:19 44:2 53:24 56:18 57:15 57:16,18 60:21	talked 33:7,10 36:14 talking 22:25 24:25 37:20 60:7	total 6:17
sealing 3:8	sorry 29:9 38:25 41:10 52:14	statements 57:4 58:15,20	task 50:8	training 38:17,19 39:14 40:19 41:2 41:16,19 42:7,11 43:16
seated 18:7	sort 7:21 14:18	statements 56:16 58:21	Taxi 24:21	transcript 63:4
seats 18:12,13	source 37:22	STATES 1:2	tell 4:19 14:4 26:10 54:13	trial 3:6
second 18:14 36:14	SOUTHERN 1:2	stating 4:2	tenure 24:9	tried 20:8 27:14,16
section 46:21 47:22 48:5	speak 11:8,13,18,20 23:4 48:15	stepped 47:7,9	terminate 45:19 46:4 48:11	true 63:4 64:11
security 13:15 15:6 16:13 22:14 29:22 30:7 34:5,21 35:3 35:7 36:8,13 59:10 62:4	speaker 1:8 5:16,21 7:12,22 8:3,6,6 9:16,23 11:5 12:16,20,23 13:11 13:13,25 14:4 15:4,14 16:2 17:13,19,19 21:18 31:21,22,24 32:3 32:10 36:10,25 38:6 43:7,19,23 44:18 45:5,18 46:8 48:10 49:17 49:21,23,23 50:3 50:6,9,9,13,19,22 50:24 51:7 52:6 53:5,7,9,25 55:24 57:2	steps 19:20 20:3 27:11 36:10 42:24 59:21 60:3,14	terminated 43:23 57:12	trying 56:23
see 22:14,25 23:4 29:18 36:16	Speakers 6:2	STIPULATED 3:3 3:7,10	termination 40:23 42:17,18 58:5,11 62:3	two 6:19 18:12,13 18:13,13 19:11 43:6,12 60:20
seen 7:20 40:4	Speaker's 10:22 11:25 12:5 13:8 14:11 28:23 36:2 40:2 43:5 46:3 51:3	STIPULATIONS 3:2	terms 4:22 13:15 14:23 16:21 20:15 30:15 36:11,18 41:20 51:12 52:6 58:15,22	U
sending 18:18	speaking 12:6	street 1:18 2:11 19:5	testified 4:6 16:4 58:11	ultimately 7:10,23
sends 9:3	speaks 47:4	streets 8:10,11,14	testify 49:4	Umm-hmm 13:12
senior 15:25 54:8	specific 20:22 54:5 62:5	stringing 33:10	testifying 4:20	understand 4:21 5:3 5:4,7 42:10 59:18
sent 52:4,19	specifically 14:14 19:16,17 20:14 21:10,12 22:4,24 23:4 27:7 36:23 47:20 55:15 61:19 61:23	strung 33:15	testimony 63:3 64:12	understandable 4:24
sentence 48:5	specifics 42:6	subject 63:5	Thank 57:19	understanding 10:8 46:2,7 48:10,17 48:22 49:15
separate 26:24,25 54:22	specified 20:19 36:22	submission 8:17	thing 14:21 34:9	understood 12:10 29:4
separately 51:18	specify 26:17	submitted 8:22 9:14	things 27:7	uniforms 17:10
Sergeant 21:14 27:21,24	speculate 58:12	subscribed 3:11 63:15	think 10:6,12 15:13 16:22 17:18 20:16 24:21 25:19 30:21 30:22 31:5 34:23 35:18 36:22 37:11 37:13,17 42:9 57:22 58:4,22	UNITED 1:2
series 54:12	speculation 58:8	subsequent 23:19 52:18 60:21	thought 28:4 30:17 32:18 49:20	unusual 14:21
serious 35:2 59:20	spoke 10:16 11:17 11:22	succeed 27:17	threatened 30:11	upcoming 14:2
seriously 29:13,14 30:4,6,13,13	staff 5:15,20 6:2,21 6:23 8:5 14:11 24:10 26:6,12,14 38:3,5,7,13,14,17 38:18,21 39:8,8 39:11,13 40:9,25 41:13,20 42:3,5	succeeded 27:19	threats 54:3,6	use 12:23 20:8 27:15 32:18 39:8
services 6:24,25 7:9 50:16 51:5		supervision 6:23 16:19	three 5:19 6:19 19:11	usual 16:23
session 14:21		supplied 35:7,9	time 3:6 6:17 14:19 14:19 15:3,3 21:8 22:13 23:8 26:19 28:19 30:4 36:7 38:20 41:11 45:17 52:11 60:4,8 62:9 62:11,15	usually 8:3 13:11 16:25 17:3,5
sessions 43:16		support 10:7 11:5 12:4	times 11:12,18	uttered 35:4
set 56:9,10 64:10,17		supported 11:25 12:20		V
Seventh 1:23		sure 12:10 24:19 41:18 42:15 44:4 54:18		Vallone 27:10 33:10 33:15,18
shake 5:2		suspend 45:19		Vann 38:22,24
shifted 60:10		suspended 43:19		Vann's 23:16 38:20
Shorthand 1:19 64:6		suspension 40:21 42:18 49:18 51:8 58:10		various 27:6 38:17 38:17
shouted 24:7		sworn 3:12 4:4 63:15 64:11		verbally 4:25
show 46:15 47:18 51:21				view 12:15 35:18 37:20,21 55:23 57:24
showed 39:10				viewed 56:6,7,8
shown 63:5				Viola 1:4 2:24 30:11 30:17,22,24 31:2 31:6 32:22
Shut 19:17				visible 17:3,7
side 18:12				voiced 29:7
sign 39:15 41:14 42:13 50:22 51:5 53:19				
signed 53:2,17,20				
signing 53:14				
simply 30:25				
sir 25:8				

voluntary 42:20	<hr/>	<hr/>
vote 10:17 23:15,15	X	30th 14:2 15:6
23:19	x 1:3,10	17:21 53:24 57:15
voted 8:19 50:5	<hr/>	363 1:23
votes 19:8	Y	394 2:5
<hr/>	yeah 7:20 22:9	<hr/>
W	year 5:22	4
waived 3:9	years 5:19 6:9,19	4 65:4
want 4:16 25:22	17:2	<hr/>
46:21,22,25 47:3	yell 19:16,17	5
47:21 51:23 57:13	yelled 27:6	5th 52:19
wanted 17:20 29:7	yelling 19:7,14 21:8	<hr/>
36:23	21:9	6
wants 50:12	York 1:2,18,18,20	61 65:8
Wareham 2:3 4:9	1:24,24 2:6,8,12	6154(WHP) 1:6
4:14 8:12 19:21	2:12,15,19,19 4:3	<hr/>
25:18,21 36:9	4:4 6:4,7 44:14	8
41:9,11 46:24	46:12 47:19 48:18	8 65:8
47:7,11 51:16	48:19 64:3,5,8	<hr/>
52:13 53:22 57:19	<hr/>	
58:17 61:5 62:7	0	
62:12 65:4	07 1:6	
wasn't 14:21 15:2,2	0842 61:7,9 65:8	
16:8 27:18 30:25	<hr/>	
32:22 50:11 56:9	1	
56:10	1 46:16 47:19	
way 33:2 35:25	1:24 1:11	
55:18 56:11 64:15	10 19:11,13	
Wayne 15:22 54:8	100 1:17 2:11	
ways 38:3	10001 1:24	
weight 58:14,22	10007 2:12,19	
59:6	11216 2:6	
went 22:18,20 23:6	12 61:6,8 65:8	
23:18,21 60:7	14 1:11	
weren't 32:13	14th 44:3	
we'll 5:10	15 19:11,13	
we've 36:14	19 6:9 19:12	
WHEREOF 64:17	<hr/>	
Withdrawn 8:12	2	
19:21 36:9 52:13	2nd 61:2,22	
58:17	2:39 62:9	
witness 3:12 18:23	2:44 62:11,15	
35:22 41:12 46:18	20th 1:23 64:18	
47:12,16 49:8	2007 1:11 9:9 13:19	
63:2 64:9,12,17	16:5 17:25 18:19	
65:3	18:21 24:18 44:3	
wondering 47:5	52:10 57:17,18	
word 31:3 32:18	58:6,20,22 59:16	
33:23 34:2,10	63:17 64:18	
35:4	21 46:21 47:22 48:5	
words 24:6	212 1:24	
work 6:6,25 12:11	250 2:18	
28:5 60:18	27th 44:3	
worked 6:3 12:9	279-5108 1:24	
16:18 45:8	28 18:19 52:10	
working 5:25 6:18	28th 52:12	
13:8 45:14	<hr/>	
wouldn't 15:19	3	
17:11 32:12	30 13:19 16:5 17:25	
write 51:7,10	18:21 24:18 57:17	
ws 39:4	57:18 58:6,20	
	59:16	



DATE TAKEN: \_\_\_\_\_

[illegible]

Subscribed and sworn to  
Before me this \_\_\_\_\_ day  
of \_\_\_\_\_, 2007

*\* Additional space for corrections provided on the other side of this sheet\**